Appraiser License

STATE OF GEORGIA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD

THOMAS MATTHEW TOUCHSTONE

3799

IS AUTHORIZED TO TRANSACT BUSINESS IN GEORGIA AS A CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY APPRAISER

THE PRIVILEGE AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THIS APPRAISER CLASSIFICATION SHALL CONTINUE IN EFFECT AS LONG AS THE APPRAISER PAYS REQUIRED APPRAISER FEES AND COMPLIES WITH ALL OTHER REQUIREMENTS OF THE OFFICIAL CODE OF GEORGIA ANNOTATED, CHAPTER 43-39-A. THE APPRAISER IS SOLELY RESPONSIBLE FOR THE PAYMENT OF ALL FEES ON A TIMELY BASIS.

D. SCOTT MURPHY Chairperson

JEFF A. LAWSON Vice Chairperson JEANMARIE HOLMES WILLIAM A. MURRAY KEITH STONE

THOMAS MATTHEW TOUCHSTONE

Status

3799 ACTIVE

ACTIVE

CERTIFIED GENERAL REAL PROPERTY
APPRAISER

THIS LICENSE EXPIRES IF YOU FAIL TO PAY RENEWAL FEES OR IF YOU FAIL TO COMPLETE ANY REQUIRED EDUCATION IN A TIMELY MANNER.

State of Georgia Real Estate Commission Suite 1000 - International Tower 229 Peachtree Street, N.E. Atlanta, GA 30303-1605 ORIGINALLY LICENSED

04/19/1993

END OF RENEWAL 01/31/2020



LYNN DEMPSEY Real Estate Commissioner

10145877

Thomas M. Touchstone Georgia Certified General Appraiser #3799

EXPERIENCE

Appraiser and Owner of Touchstone Appraisal Services 2006 to present

Appraiser and Co-Owner of Dunaway Appraisal Services, Inc., 1992 to 2006

Real estate salesperson, Bowers and Burns Real Estate Company, 2006 to Present

Arbitrator, Georgia Department of Audits, July 2002.

Residential Appraiser with Dunaway Appraisal Services, 1988 to 1989,

Apprentice Residential Appraiser with Georgia Real Estate Services and Dunaway Appraisal Services, 1985 to 1988.

- Served the west Georgia and Greater Metropolitan Atlanta area for over 25 years
 providing both narrative and form appraisal reports on commercial, industrial,
 institutional, residential, non-commercial agricultural and recreational properties
 for banks, mortgage companies, relocation companies, attorneys, and individuals
- Completed numerous appraisals for right-of-way acquisition or condemnation for various municipalities, county, state, and federal agencies
- Testified in local and state courts and depositions as an expert witness

EDUCATION

University of Georgia, Bachelor of Arts, Communications, 1987.

Georgia MLS, Salesperson License Course, December 2005

Appraisal Institute, General Certification Curriculum, 2002 - 2003

Lee & Grant Company, Appraiser licensure curriculum, 1992 - 1993.

National Association of Fee Appraisers, "Appraiser licensure curriculum 1988

All continuing education requirements to satisfy the Georgia Real Estate Appraisers Board have been met through various approved schools both on-line and in the classroom.

NAVIGATORS INSURANCE COMPANY

THIS IS A CLAIMS MADE INSURANCE POLICY.

THIS POLICY APPLIES ONLY TO THOSE CLAIMS THAT ARE FIRST MADE AGAINST THE INSURED DURING THE POLICY PERIOD. ALL CLAIMS MUST BE REPORTED IN WRITING TO THE COMPANY DURING THE POLICY PERIOD OR WITHIN 60 DAYS AFTER THE END OF THE POLICY PERIOD.

PLEASE READ THIS POLICY CAREFULLY.

REAL ESTATE PROFESSIONAL ERRORS AND OMISSIONS INSURANCE POLICY DECLARATIONS

	POLICY NUMBER: PH18RELM	M02700IV	RENEWAL OF:	PH17RELM02700IV
1.	NAMED INSURED: Thomas M. Touchstone DBA: Touchsto	ne Appraisal S	Services	
2.	ADDRESS: 3 Plum Lane Newnan, GA 30263			
3.	POLICY PERIOD: FROM: 10/1 12:01 A.M. Standard Time at the		TO: 10/11/2019 ne Named Insured as	s stated in Number 2 above.
4.	LIMITS OF LIABILITY:	\$ 1,000,	,000	Per Claim
		\$ 2,000	,000	Annual Aggregate
5.	DEDUCTIBLE: \$1,000			
6.	PREMIUM: \$ 1,101.00 TAXES: \$	\$		
7.	RETROACTIVE DATE: 10/11/200	7		



Touchstone Appraisal Services

3 Plum Lane, Newnan, Georgia 30263 Phone 770-301-4343 tomtouchstone33@gmail.com

March 27, 2019

Dan Davis
Integrated Science and Engineering as property manager for
Peachtree City Water and Sewer Authority
1039 Sullivan Road
Newnan, GA 30265

RE: Appraisal of a proposed cart path easement approximately 6,670 SFGA east of GA Hwy 74, Peachtree City, GA 30269 (tax parcel 0614 027)

Dear Mr. Davis:

Pursuant to your request, I am happy to submit a proposal for the appraisal of the real property parcel for the potential cart path easement off of GA Hwy 74.

The appraisal shall be prepared for Integrated Science and Engineering as property manager for Peachtree City Water and Sewer Authority. The purpose of this appraisal is to estimate the market value of the property. The legal property appraised would be the *fee simple* interest as well as easement interests (permanent and temporary). The property will be valued as of the date of inspection.

The appraisal will be prepared in accordance with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice and the Limiting Conditions and Appraiser's Certification outlined in this letter. Your signature of this letter verifies your acceptance of the terms of this engagement. Please review the Limiting Conditions and Appraiser's Certification under which the appraisal report shall be prepared. The scope of the appraisal will be the Sales Comparison Approach only. The report will be presented in a narrative format on the 388C form.

The estimated completion date of the appraisal is April 25, 2019. In order to complete this appraisal, the following information is requested *if available*: Current survey and an engineering plan of the proposed project.

I will furnish you with an electronic copy of the appraisal report. My fee for this appraisal will be \$1,500. A bill for these expenses will be provided to you upon completion of the report.

A Statement of Limiting Conditions and Appraiser's Certification under which this engagement is bound is as follows:

This appraisal is to be used only for the purpose stated herein. While distribution of this appraisal in its entirety is at the discretion of the client, individual sections shall not be distributed; this report is intended to be used in whole and not in part.

No part of this appraisal, its value estimates or the identity of the firm or the appraiser(s) may be communicated to the public through advertising, public relations, media sales, or other media.

All files, work papers and documents developed in connection with this assignment are the property of Touchstone Appraisal Services. Information, estimates and opinions are verified where possible, but cannot be guaranteed. Plans provided are intended to assist the client in visualizing the property; no other use of these plans is intended or permitted.

No hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil or structure, which would make the property more or less valuable, were discovered by the appraiser(s) or made known to the appraiser(s). No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or engineering necessary to discover them. Unless otherwise stated, this appraisal assumes there is no existence of hazardous materials or conditions, in any form, on or near the subject property.

Unless otherwise stated in this report, the existence of hazardous substances, including without limitation asbestos, polychlorinated biphenyl, petroleum leakage, or agricultural chemicals, which may or may not be present on the property, was not called to the attention of the appraiser nor did the appraiser become aware of such during the appraiser's inspection. The appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property unless otherwise stated. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to test for such substances. The presence of such hazardous substances may affect the value of the property. The value opinion developed herein is predicated on the assumption that no such hazardous substances exist on or in the property or in such proximity thereto, which would cause a loss in value. No responsibility is assumed for any such hazardous substances, nor for any expertise or knowledge required to discover them.

Unless stated herein, the property is assumed to be outside of areas where flood hazard insurance is mandatory. Maps used by public and private agencies to determine these areas are limited with respect to accuracy. Due diligence has been exercised in interpreting these maps, but no responsibility is assumed for misinterpretation.

Page 3

Good title, free of liens, encumbrances and special assessments is assumed. No responsibility is assumed for matters of a legal nature.

Necessary licenses, permits, consents, legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or Federal government or private entity are assumed to be in place or reasonably obtainable.

It is assumed there are no zoning violations, encroachments, easements or other restrictions which would affect the subject property, unless otherwise stated.

The appraiser(s) are not required to give testimony in Court in connection with this appraisal. If the appraisers are subpoenaed pursuant to a court order, the client agrees to pay the appraiser(s) Touchstone Appraisal Services' regular per diem rate plus expenses.

Appraisals are based on the data available at the time the assignment is completed. Amendments/modifications to appraisals based on new information made available after the appraisal was completed will be made, as soon as reasonably possible, for an additional fee.

We will proceed with the preparation of this appraisal upon receipt of a signed copy of this letter. If you have any questions about anything contained in this letter or in any of the attachments, please give us a call.

Sincerely,

Thomas M. Touchstone

Georgia Certified General Real Property Appraiser #3799

Engagement Letter Accepted:

(client signature)

(date)



May 6, 2019



310 Route 17 North Upper Saddle River, NJ 07458 (201) 934-0505



Table of Contents

Objective	2
Methodology	2
PCWASA Benefits Scorecard	3
Findings	4





Objective

Compensation Resources, Inc. (CRI) was engaged by Peachtree City Water and Sewerage Authority (herein referred to as "PCWASA" or the "Authority") to undertake a benchmark study of its benefits package. The results of this study will allow PCWASA to better understand its benefits offerings as compared to similar market segments (industry and geography).

Methodology

- **CRI** collected and reviewed information on the current benefits package offered to PCWASA's employees. Thereafter, a benefits analysis, utilizing published survey data, was conducted in order to determine the market competitiveness of PCWASA's benefits plans in comparison to other Utility organizations in the Southeast region of the United States.
- **CRI** evaluated the competitiveness of the following benefits:
 - Medical Coverage
 - Dental Coverage
 - o Vision Insurance
 - Paid Time Off
 - Sick Leave
 - Holidays
 - Jury Duty
 - Bereavement Days
 - Military Leave

- o FSA
- Health & Wellness Benefits
- Retirement Benefits
- Disability Benefits
- Life Insurance
- Education Assistance
- Employee Assistance Program
- Travel Reimbursement

¹ The National Survey of Company Benefits Programs and Policies; CompData Surveys (2017-2018).





PCWASA Benefits Scorecard

• We have prepared the following scorecard which illustrates the Authority's competitiveness with respect to its benefit offerings:

PCWASA Benefits Scorecard

Benefit	Not Offered	Not Competitive	Competitive	Very Competitive
Medical Coverage			✓	
Dental Coverage				✓
Vision Insurance			✓	
Paid Time Off			✓	
Sick Leave				✓
Holidays				✓
Jury Duty				✓
Bereavement Days			✓	
Military Leave				✓
FSA	✓			
Health & Wellness Benefits			✓	
Retirement Benefits				✓
Disability Benefits			✓	
Life Insurance				✓
Education Assistance			✓	
Employee Assistance Program			✓	
Travel Reimbursement				✓

• The areas where the Authority is either below market or where the benefit is not offered provide an opportunity to reassess those specific offerings.





Findings

• The following tables provide an overview of PCWASA's benefits package,² as compared to typical benefits provided within the Utilities sector in the Southeast region.

Medical Coverage (POS Plan)

	Medical Coverage (POS Plan)				
	PCWASA		Southeast- Utilities		
0	PCWASA offers 2 POS plans: Gold and Platinum	0	83.3% of employers offer Medical POS Plans		
0	Gold monthly premium cost paid by employee:	0	Prevalent premium monthly cost paid by employee:		
	Employee only: \$38		Employee only: \$76-\$150		
	Employee plus Child: \$70		Employee plus one: >\$250		
	Employee plus Spouse: \$76		Employee plus family (spouse, children, or combined):		
	Employee plus Family: \$108		>\$250		
0	Gold annual deductible:	0	Average Annual deductible:		
	Individual: \$1,500		Employee only: \$501-\$1,000		
	Family: \$3,000		Employee plus Family: >\$2,000		
0	Gold copay:	0	Average Copay:		
	Primary: \$35		Primary: \$24		
	Specialist: \$70		Specialist: \$40		
0	Platinum monthly premium cost paid by employee:				
	Employee only: \$197				
	Employee plus Child: \$364				
	Employee plus Spouse: \$394				
	Employee plus Family: \$561				
0	Platinum annual deductible:				
	Individual: \$1,500				
	Family: \$3,000				
0	Platinum copay:				
	Primary: \$25				
	Specialist: \$50				

² PCWASA benefits information provided by the Authority.



Page 4



Dental Coverage

	PCWASA		Southeast- Utilities
0	PCWASA provides Dental coverage and pays 100% of monthly	0	100.0% of employers offer dental insurance
	premiums for employees. The plan provides a \$1,500 maximum	0	Prevalent premium monthly cost paid by employee:
	benefit per family member per calendar year		Employee only: \$1-\$25
0	Annual deductible:		Employee plus one: \$1-\$25
	Individual: \$25		Employee plus family: \$26-\$49
	Family: \$75	0	50.0% of employers offer a maximum benefit per family member
			of \$1,001-\$1,500
		0	Annual deductible:
			Employee only: \$50
			Employee plus Family: \$101-\$150

Vision Insurance

Southeast- Utilities
100.0% offer vision insurance
Prevalent premium monthly cost paid by employee (for all tiers):
\$1-\$25
Ρ





Paid Time Off

PCWASA		Southeast- Utilities
PTO accrued by years of service:		40.0% of organizations offer a formal PTO program
0 to 5 years: 10 days	0	63.4% of organizations accrue PTO based on years of service
	0	
5 to 10 years: 15 days	0	Average days off for exempt employees accrued by years of
10 to 15 years: 20 days		service:
15 to 20 years: 25 days		During 1 st year: 10 days
20+ years: 30 days		1 year: 15 days
Maximum Carryover: 50 days		2 to 4 years: 17 days
		5 to 9 years: 19 days
		10 to 14 years: 23 days
		15 to 19 years: 26 days
		20 to 24 years: 28 days
		25 to 29 years: 30 days
		30+ years: 32 days
		Maximum Carryover: 32 days
	0	Average days off for non-exempt employees accrued by years of
		service:
		During 1 st year: 10 days
		1 year: 15 days
		2 to 4 years: 16 days
		5 to 9 years : 18 days
		10 to 14 years: 22 days
		15 to 19 years: 26 days
		20 to 24 years: 28 days
		25 to 29 years: 30 days
		30+ years: 30 days
		Maximum Carryover: 30 days





Sick Leave

	\$1500 EBB 15				
	PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities			
0	Sick Leave is accrued by hours worked at a rate of 3.7 hours per pay-period and accumulated to a maximum allowed accrual of 80 days that will carryover.	 Average sick leave days for exempt employees: 8.8 Average sick leave days for non-exempt employees: 8.2 Maximum annual accrual for all employees: 9.3 			
0	Employees may donate sick leave to fellow employees with approval from HR	 78.6% of employers allow carryover for sick leave. 			

Holidays

	- / -
PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities
 PCWASA observes 11 holidays. 	 The average number of holidays observed is 9.7
 Holidays that occur while an employee is using annual, sick or 	
other paid leave shall not be charged against the employee as	
annual, sick or other paid.	

Jury Duty

PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities
 PCWASA provides jury duty leave with pay and no limit on the number of days provided. 	 32.8 % of participants provide jury duty leave. The average number of days provided is 11.2 73.5% of organizations report no limit on the number of paid jury.
	 72.5% of organizations report no limit on the number of paid jury duty days.

Bereavement Days

PCWASA		Southeast- Utilities
 PCWASA provides up to 3 days paid leave per year for the death of immediate family members. 	0 0	32.2% of participants provide bereavement leave The average number of days provided is 3.3 per occurrence





Military Leave

PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities
 PCWASA provides up to 5 years military leave. Compensation from PCWASA is calculated as the difference between the employee's base pay from PCWASA and the 	 18.5% of participants provide military leave. The average number of days provided is 86.0 58.4% of organizations report no limit on the number of paid
employee's military pay.	military leave days

Flexible Spending Accounts (FSA)

PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities
 PCWASA does not offer an FSA. 	o 92.0% of employers offer an FSA

Health & Wellness Benefits

	PCWASA		Southeast- Utilities		
0	PCWASA offers the following wellness benefits:	0	Most prevalent wellness benefits:		
	Care24		Flu Shots/Immunizations: 91.7%		
	Flu shots		Offer Rewards/Incentives: 83.3%		
	Health Discount Program:		Tobacco Cessation: 83.3%		
	Fitness club membership: \$46 (without discount)		Biometric Screening: 79.2%		
	Lasik: \$3,000 (without discount)		Health Risk Assessment: 79.2%		
	Teeth whitening: \$330 (without discount)	Weight Management: 66.7%			
	Maternity Support Program		Annual Physicals: 58.3%		
	Rally Health and Wellness		Physical Fitness Facility: 45.0%		
	Real Appeal		Onsite Health Clinic: 16.7%		
	Simply Engaged with Gym Check-In: Employees can earn up				
	to \$240 for completing program				
	UHC Tools/Communication Resource Center				
	Virtual Visits				





Retirement Benefits

	PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities ³		
0	PCWASA offers 401(a) and 457(B) retirement plans with full	0	43.5% of employers offer a defined contribution plan.	
	vesting after 5 years.	0	21.7% of employers offer a 457(b) plan with employer	
0	457(b) Plan		contribution.	
	Employees are permitted to defer up to 8% of their annual salary into the 457(b) plan.	0	On average, 86.1% of the employee contribution is matched by the organization, regardless of the type of plan. The maximum	
0	401(a) Plan PCWASA contributes 8% of an employee's salary PCWASA will match an additional 100% of salary deferrals made into the 457(b) plan, up to the employee 8% deferral max to the 401(a) plan.	0	percent of salary matched by the organization is 5.1%. The average number of years required for full vesting for 457(b) and 401(k) plans is 2.7	

Disability Benefits

PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities		
Long-Term Disability: Paid by PCWASA at 60% of earnings up to	 96.0% offer long-term disability insurance 		
policy maximum, at no cost to the employee.	 84.0% offer short-term disability insurance 		
Short-Term Disability: voluntary benefit funded solely by the			
employee.			

³ Data provided for 401(k), as 401(a) retirement plans are not reported in the survey.





Life Insurance

	PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities		
0	PCWASA offers life insurance to full-time employees at no cost	0	100% offer Basic Life Insurance	
	and covers the cost of coverage in full. Additionally, life insurance	0	76.0% of companies use a pay multiple to compute coverage	
	for a spouse and children is provided:		amount.	
	Employee Coverage: Up to 2x base salary + \$15,000	0	61.1% of companies use 2x salary; 22.2% use over 2x salary;	
	Spouse Coverage: \$5,000		11.1% use 1x salary	
Child Coverage:		0	50% of companies offer coverage for employee spouses and	
	0 to 6 months old: \$1,000		76.2% of offer coverage for children	
	> 6 months old: \$2,500	0	Maximum dependent coverage offered:	
			Spouse: \$20,001 to \$100,000	
			Child: \$5,001 to \$10,000	

Education Assistance

PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities		
 PCWASA offers education assistance in the form of tuition reimbursement and reimbursement for other applicable education expenses related to professional development. 	 80.8% of all full-time employees are eligible for tuition reimbursement. The average annual maximum tuition reimbursement benefit is \$4,133 		

Employee Assistance Program

	PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities		
C	PCWASA offers Employee Assistance Programs through Magellan Healthcare.	o 100.0% of employers offer Employee Assistance Programs		





Travel Reimbursement

PCWASA	Southeast- Utilities		
o PCWASA provides reimbursement for air fare, meals, and mileage.		68.0% of employers provide mileage reimbursement	

 $Z: \verb|\Peachtree City Water \& Sewer Authority \verb|\190125 Benefits Study rev3.docx WTS| \\$





May 24, 2019



310 Route 17 North Upper Saddle River, NJ 07458 (201) 934-0505



Table of Contents

Table of Contents	2
INTRODUCTION AND PURPOSE	
METHODOLOGY	
FINDINGS	
ATTACHMENT A: INCLUDED POSITIONS	
ATTACHMENT B: SURVEY LIST	8
ATTACHMENT C	EXCEL WORKBOOK





Introduction and Purpose

Compensation Resources, Inc. (CRI) was engaged by Integrated Science & Engineering on behalf of Peachtree City Water and Sewerage Authority (herein referred to as "PCWASA" or the "Authority") to undertake a comprehensive market study of Base Salary for 18 positions, using published survey data as the basis for research.

The information contained herein is provided for informational purposes and is not intended to provide legal, accounting, tax or investment advice and/or services.





Methodology

CRI's market analysis of competitive compensation levels undertakes a systematic methodology that looks at a number of factors in order to provide the most applicable data for each job being evaluated. These factors include, but are not limited to, job content, organizational revenue and profile, industry, and geographic region (where applicable). The following identifies the steps undertaken during the analysis.

General

- **CRI** collected various documents and materials from PCWASA relevant to this study, including but not limited to, background information on the Authority, data related to the compensation of its staff and information pertaining to the duties and responsibilities of each position.
- Fact-finding interviews were held with Dan Davis and Leslie Baer of Integrated Science & Engineering to learn more about PCWASA, its culture and it challenges, and to understand more about the current compensation components and compensation needs.

Market Study

- CRI reviewed job descriptions provided by PCWASA to understand the duties, responsibilities, and
 complexity of each position, to be used as the baseline for extracting compensation data from the
 competitive marketplace. The complete list of positions included in the market study can be found in
 Attachment A.
- Published surveys were utilized in order to collect appropriate market information. Position matches were based on the comparability of the job criteria provided in the job descriptions (duties, responsibilities, and reporting relationships) to published job summaries in the salary surveys.
- In order to further increase the comparability of the survey data to PCWASA's positions, data was selected based on meeting one or more of the following criteria:
 - o Industries: Government Entity, Utilities/General Industry
 - o Geographic Location: Peachtree City, GA
 - Revenue: Approximately \$10 million
 - Market Positioning: 25th Percentile, Market Average, and 75th Percentile
- Where only national data was available, data was increased by 1.8% to reflect the average geographic differential between the United States and Peachtree City, GA.
- In order to recognize that PCWASA competes in both the municipal and for-profit marketplaces, published survey data was collected in two (2) data sets:
 - Government Entities
 - Utilities/General Industry





- **CRI** conducted a comprehensive competitive market study of Base Salary of comparable positions by utilizing seven (7) published surveys and databases and one (1) salary planning survey to obtain market data. A list of these surveys is included in **Attachment B**.
- All published survey data was aged to July 1, 2019, using a 2.8% appropriate aging factor, which is the projected merit increase percent for 2019 for positions in related organizations.
- To determine the market value, *CRI* calculated the Mean, Median, Trimmed Mean, and Market Consensus of all published survey data points within each data set. The definitions of these measures of central tendency are as follows:
 - Mean: Simple average.
 - Median: The middle number (the 50th percentile).
 - Trimmed Mean: Average that eliminates the high and low data elements.
 - o Market Consensus (MC): The average of the Mean, Median, and Trimmed Mean; represents our best estimate of the market value (consensus) for the position.
- To calculate the Combined Market Consensus, each data set was averaged with an equal weighting.
- Since various elements can influence the compensation levels within the organization (e.g., Compensation Philosophy, performance, market positioning, etc.), it is our practice to develop a statistical sample range from the data for Base Salary. We have calculated and shown the 25th percentile and 75th percentile levels from the market data researched. Actual pay levels within the 25th to 75th percentile levels represent one-half (50%) of the sampled population and would be considered "within market."
 - 70th percentile data has been presented in order for PCWASA to evaluate the market findings against the recently adopted salary structure, which targets the 70th percentile. In addition PCWASA requested data be presented at the 85th percentile.
 - This spread indicates where we would typically find the range of compensation for fully experienced individuals within that position. Market Range placement, however, differs from assignment within a salary range, which provides the full opportunity for pay for a given position. An individual's placement within a salary range is driven by multiple factors, such as length of time in position, performance, and retention needs. Therefore, an individual who is "above" or "below" the Market Range may actually fall within the parameters of a salary range. Market Range is used as an analytical tool to examine the relationship of pay for positions against the competitive marketplace. The salary range is an internal tool that provides an organization with the means by which to manage compensation for its staff, in consideration of the marketplace.
- Attachment C presents the market study findings for the included positions.
- **CRI** also conducted shift differential research for second and third shift.





Findings

- It is important to note that the methodology used to conduct the competitive market study contained
 in this report is based on the duties and responsibilities associated with each position, and does not
 take into consideration the incumbent or any factors relating to that incumbent. This is the standard
 and accepted procedure used to identify the market value of a position and to determine what the
 Organization would have to provide in order to recruit and hire a fully qualified candidate for the
 position.
- For purposes of this analysis, job content for each included position was examined via a current job description. Each position was matched to the marketplace as follows:

Table I
Position Matching Table

Position Matching Table				
PCWASA Position Title	Survey Position Match			
Assistant Collections Supervisor	Maintenance Supervisor w/ 15% discount			
Assistant Operations Field Supervisor	Water Treatment Plant Supervisor w/ 15% discount			
Collections Maintenance Coordinator	Maintenance Mechanic III			
Collections Supervisor	Maintenance Supervisor			
Construction Coordinator	N/A ¹			
Executive Administrative Assistant	Administrative Assistant IV			
GIS Specialist/FOG Program Coordinator	GIS Analyst I			
Locate Technician/Maintenance Repair Worker	N/A ²			
Maintenance Repair Worker Trainee	Maintenance Worker I			
Maintenance Repair Technician	Maintenance Worker II			
Maintenance Repair Technician Sr	Maintenance Worker III			
Operations Field Supervisor	Water Treatment Plant Supervisor			
Operations Maintenance Technician	Maintenance Worker III			
Plant Operator III	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator I			
Plant Operator II	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator II			
Plant Operator I	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator III			
Press Operator/Driver	Heavy Truck Driver			
Pump Station Maintenance Leader	Instrument Technician III			

- PCWASA currently offers shift differential compensation to full time, hourly employees within the Operations Department. Shift differentials are provided as a percent of base salary.
- Research found that 74.6% of organizations reported offering shift differentials as follows:

² Insufficient survey data available.



¹ Insufficient survey data available.



Table II
Shift Differentials by Employee Group³

Employee Group	2 nd Shift Flat \$	3 rd Shift Flat \$	2 nd Shift %	3 rd Shift %			
Hourly	.58	.67	7.7	9.5			
Administrative	.63	.72	9.4	10.0			
Technical/Professional	.89	1.04	9.6	11.4			
Management	.91	1.07	9.4	10.7			

³ Compensation Data Manufacturing & Distribution Southeast; CompData (2017). It should be noted that while the data reported is not industry specific, it represents employee roles that would be found within PCWASA's industry.



Page 6



Attachment A: Included Positions

- Assistant Collections Supervisor
- Assistant Operations Field Supervisor
- Collections Maintenance Coordinator
- Collections Supervisor
- Construction Coordinator
- Executive Administrative Assistant
- GIS Specialist/FOG Program Coordinator
- Locate Technician/Maintenance Repair Worker
- Maintenance Repair Worker Trainee
- Maintenance Repair Technician
- Maintenance Repair Technician Sr
- Operations Field Supervisor
- Operations Maintenance Technician
- Plant Operator III
- Plant Operator II
- Plant Operator I
- Press Operator/Driver
- Pump Station Maintenance Leader





Attachment B: Survey List

CRI conducted the competitive market study of comparable positions utilizing the following published surveys:

Survey Title	Publisher	Year
Compensation Survey - Medium Sized Water & Wastewater Utilities	American Water Works Association	2018
Benchmark Pro National	CompData	2018
Not-For-Profit Compensation Survey	CompData	2018
Salary Assessor	ERI	2019
National Executive Compensation Survey	MEA (MidAtlantic Employers Association)	2018
National Wage & Salary Survey	MEA (MidAtlantic Employers Association)	2019
CompAnalyst	Salary.com Subscription Services	2019
Salary Budget Survey	WorldatWork	2018-2019

Z:\Peachtree City Water & Sewer Authority\190214 Report of Findings rev 4.docx WTS



	Combined (Government 1: Utilities 1) ¹				Government				Utilities						
	25th %ile	Wtd Average	70th %ile	75th %ile		25th %ile	Wtd Average	70th %ile	75th %ile		25th %ile	Wtd Average	70th %ile	75th %ile	
Job Title	Base Salary	Base Salary ²	Base Salary	Base Salary	85th %ile	Base Salary	Base Salary ²	Base Salary	Base Salary	85th %ile	Base Salary	Base Salary ²	Base Salary	Base Salary	85th %ile
Operations Field Supervisor	\$57,300	\$69,600	\$74,100	\$75,400	\$78,500	\$53,600	\$65,200	\$69,000	\$70,100	\$72,700	\$61,000	\$73,900	\$79,100	\$80,600	\$84,200
Collections Supervisor	\$59,500	\$66,400	\$71,400	\$72,800	\$76,300	\$51,800	\$56,800	\$60,400	\$61,400	\$63,900	\$67,100	\$75,900	\$82,300	\$84,100	\$88,500
Assistant Operations Field Supervisor	\$48,700	\$59,100	\$63,000	\$64,100	\$66,800	\$45,600	\$55,400	\$58,700	\$59,600	\$61,900	\$51,800	\$62,800	\$67,200	\$68,500	\$71,600
Assistant Collections Supervisor	\$50,500	\$56,400	\$60,600	\$61,800	\$64,700	\$44,000	\$48,300	\$51,300	\$52,100	\$54,200	\$57,000	\$64,500	\$70,000	\$71,500	\$75,300
Pump Stations Maintenance Leader	\$48,900	\$55,700	\$60,500	\$61,900	\$65,300	\$48,100	\$54,600	\$58,900	\$60,100	\$63,100	\$49,700	\$56,800	\$62,100	\$63,600	\$67,300
Executive Administrative Assistant	\$45,700	\$53,100	\$59,400	\$61,200	\$65,600	\$45,300	\$52,900	\$59,500	\$61,400	\$66,000	\$46,100	\$53,300	\$59,200	\$60,900	\$65,000
Collections Maintenance Coordinator	\$46,900	\$53,100	\$57,400	\$58,600	\$61,600	\$44,700	\$50,800	\$54,500	\$55,500	\$58,000	\$49,000	\$55,400	\$60,200	\$61,600	\$65,000
Plant Operator I	\$44,300	\$51,800	\$57,600	\$59,200	\$63,200	\$41,200	\$47,000	\$51,500	\$52,800	\$55,900	\$47,300	\$56,500	\$63,500	\$65,500	\$70,400
GIS Specialist/FOG Program Coordinator	\$45,400	\$50,300	\$53,400	\$54,300	\$56,500	\$43,200	\$47,700	\$50,300	\$51,000	\$52,800	\$47,500	\$52,800	\$56,500	\$57,500	\$60,000
Maintenance Repair Technician Sr	\$44,500	\$49,600	\$52,900	\$53,800	\$56,100	\$40,100	\$45,100	\$46,900	\$47,400	\$48,600	\$48,900	\$54,100	\$58,900	\$60,200	\$63,500
Operations Maintenance Technician	\$44,500	\$49,600	\$52,900	\$53,800	\$56,100	\$40,100	\$45,100	\$46,900	\$47,400	\$48,600	\$48,900	\$54,100	\$58,900	\$60,200	\$63,500
Plant Operator II	\$39,600	\$46,400	\$51,200	\$52,600	\$56,000	\$37,800	\$43,100	\$46,900	\$48,000	\$50,600	\$41,400	\$49,600	\$55,400	\$57,100	\$61,200
Maintenance Repair Technician	\$40,700	\$45,300	\$48,300	\$49,200	\$51,300	\$37,500	\$42,100	\$43,800	\$44,300	\$45,500	\$43,900	\$48,500	\$52,800	\$54,000	\$57,000
Press Operator/Driver	\$40,700	\$45,100	\$48,500	\$49,400	\$51,700	\$40,500	\$43,300	\$45,900	\$46,600	\$48,400	\$40,900	\$46,800	\$51,000	\$52,200	\$55,100
Plant Operator III	\$35,700	\$40,100	\$43,400	\$44,300	\$46,600	\$33,600	\$38,100	\$41,600	\$42,600	\$45,000	\$37,800	\$42,100	\$45,100	\$45,900	\$48,000
Maintenance Repair Worker Trainee	\$33,900	\$38,000	\$40,600	\$41,300	\$43,100	\$33,200	\$36,900	\$39,200	\$39,900	\$41,500	\$34,500	\$39,100	\$41,800	\$42,600	\$44,500
Construction Coordinator ³	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Locate Technician/Maintenance Repair Worker ³	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

¹Survey Data Industry Weighting: Government 1x: Utilities 1x

²Weighted Average Base Salary

³Insufficient data

PCWASA PAY RANGES

JUNE 2019

POSITION TITLE	MINIMUM	MAXIMUM
Plant Operator Trainee	\$30,642	\$50,558
Plant Operator III	\$32,755	\$54,045
Plant Operator II	\$38,642	\$63,758
Plant Operator I	\$43,472	\$71,728
Press Operator/Driver	\$36,604	\$60,396
Assistant Treatment System Supervisor	\$47,547	\$78,453
Treatment System Supervisor	\$55,925	\$92,275
Collection Maintenance Technician Trainee	\$30,642	\$50,558
Collection Maintenance Technician	\$36,453	\$60,147
Collection Maintenance Technician Senior	\$39,925	\$65,875
Assistant Collection System Supervisor	\$45,736	\$75,464
Collection System Supervisor	\$53,887	\$88,913
Construction Coordinator	\$51,611	\$85,159
Technical Support Coordinator	\$40,302	\$66,498
Executive Administrative Assistant	\$44,830	\$73,970
Maintenance Supervisor	\$43,321	\$71,479
Maintenance Technician	\$39,925	\$65,875
Instrumentation Technician	\$45,660	\$75,340



JOB DESCRIPTION

Title: <u>Controller</u>

Division: Administrative Services

Reports to: General Manager

I. Position Summary

The Controller is responsible for managing and approving all ongoing accounting policies and procedures relative to the operation of the organization, as well as managing financial and operational reconciliations and reports. Responsibilities include managing formal accounting duties, accounting records, and managing the preparation of reports, reconciliations and help preparing the budget.

II. Essential Duties

- Prepare Annual Budget
 - o Collaborate with Department Managers, General Manager, and Deputy General Manager
- Post Monthly Processes & Prepare Financial Reports
 - o Record Journal Entries, Monthly Budgetary Reports & Operational Analyses
- Manage Accounts Payable
 - O Approve invoices for payment, Maintain Original Source Documentation
- Manage Cash Flow
 - Monitor Operating Account Balances, Manage Investment Balances
- Manage Payroll
 - Approve Bi-weekly Timekeeping Data, Manage all payroll functions, Reporting Requirements
- Administer Retirement Plans
 - Reporting Requirements, Payment Processes, Participant Management
- Manage Accounts Receivables
 - Billing Functions, Oversee Cash Receipting
- Oversee Banking Functions
 - o Monthly Reconciliations for all Accounts
- Manage Year-end Processes
 - o Closing entries, Budget Amendments,
- Annual Audit
 - Coordinate with Outside Auditors, Prepare all Audit Documents, Review Annually the Internal Accounting Policies and Procedures
- Risk Management
- Tax Reporting
- Annual Bond Review
- Fixed Asset Supervision, monitoring the use of fixed assets and procurement activity
- Government Accounting Standards & Government Auditing Standards

Title: <u>Controller</u>

Division: Administrative Services

III. Qualifications

The qualifications listed below represent the credentials necessary to perform the essential functions of this position. To be successful in this position, an individual must be able to perform each duty satisfactorily. Reasonable accommodation may be made to enable individuals with disabilities to perform the essential functions.

A. Education and/or Experience

Bachelor's Degree in accounting or related field with over ten years of directly related experience; or Master's Degree and five years directly related experience. Master's preferred. Strong management, communication, and organizational skills required.

B. Supervisory Controls:

Must possess ability to communicate well with others.

IV. Working Conditions

A. Physical Demands

The employee may sit to complete a majority of the work. However, there may be some walking, standing, stooping, carrying of light items such as papers, books, or driving an automobile. No special physical demands are required to perform the work.

B. Work Environment

This work is generally performed in an office environment.



DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER

Organization: Peachtree City Water and Sewerage Authority

Location: Peachtree City, Georgia

Type of Position: Full-Time

Education Requirement: High School Diploma required, Bachelor's Degree prefered

Experience Requirement: 10 or more years

Salary Range: Commensurate with experience

Reports to: General Manager

General Responsibilities:

The Deputy General Manager position is responsible for the overall operational management of the Authority including the financial, technical, maintenance and repair, operational, developmental, public relations, and administrative functions. Position requires the exercise of independent judgment and discretion in meeting the objectives established under policies established by the General Manager and Authority Board, as well as regulatory agencies.

Typical Duties and Responsibilities:

- Oversee the operations of the Authority and its staff. Regularly meets with department management and other staff to discuss operational issues.
- Monitor operations while continually evaluating and implementing operational improvements.
- Assist with implementation of rules, regulations and administrative policies for internal operations.
- Hire and manage a diverse staff of employees, both directly and through subordinates. Assist with payrolls and perform other necessary supervisory functions.
- Assist with budget preparation and monitoring including recommendations and regular budget updates to the Authority Board.
- Coordinate with regulatory agencies and other political organizations to establish and maintain good working relationships. Represent the Authority at a variety of public meetings and make presentations as necessary.
- Ensure the provision of adequate treatment and compliance with all regulatory permits including urban reuse quality water.
- Maintain awareness of advances in technological activities. Encourage staff to maintain professional and technical expertise and skills.
- Perform other related work as necessary.

Knowledge, Skills and Abilities:

- Knowledge of the principles and methods of public utility administration and wastewater treatment design and operation.
- Knowledge of rate determination and financing principles and practices relating to public utilities, including billing and utility accounting.
- Knowledge of general business administration including financial management, general accounting, program planning, and budget development and monitoring.



- Knowledge of supervisory, affirmative action, and related personnel laws, rules, policies and practices. Ability to hire, terminate, train, and supervise professional and support staff.
- Ability to communicate effectively, both in writing and orally, including the ability to make presentations to groups.
- Ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships with staff, government officials, water planning districts, governmental agencies, the media, the public, and other stakeholders.

Training and Experience:

Ten or more years of responsible supervision of personnel and administrative experience as a division manager or supervisor with a public utility or equivalent. Bachelor's degree in civil engineering, construction management, environmental engineering, business management, public administration, or similar field preferred but not required. Experience related to the Typical Duties and Responsibilities and Knowledge, Skills and Abilities outlined above will be considered in lieu of a Bachelor's degree. Certification as a Class I Wastewater Treatment Operator or Class I Wastewater Collection Operator in the State of Georgia is required.



Peachtree City Water & Sewerage

Short Term Disability

Effective July 1, 2019

Principal*	Principal				
Benefits	Option 1	Option 2			
Schedule of Benefits					
Elimination Period					
Injury	8th Day	15th Day			
Sickness	8th Day	15th Day			
Benefit Percentage	60%	60%			
Maximum Weekly Benefit	\$1,000	\$1,000			
Benefit Duration	8 Weeks	7 Weeks			
Financials					
Weekly Covered Payroll	\$11,793.00	\$11,793.00			
Rate per \$10 of Weekly Benefit	\$0.380	\$0.300			
Estimated Monthly Premium	\$448.13	\$353.79			
Estimated Annual Premium	\$5,377.61	\$4,245.48			
Participation Requirement	100% of Eligible	100% of Eligible			
Rate Guarantee	To 12/1/2021	To 12/1/2021			

Note: The plan descriptions are based on JSL's interpretation of the current plan design. We have attempted to duplicate the existing schedule of benefits, but actual plan provisions and claim administration will vary between insurance carriers. This description does not replace or supersede the contract. Insurance company offers are based on the information submitted and plan design outlined. Rating and conditions may be modified or withdrawn in the event that the risk characteristics at the time of enrollment are materially different from those assumed in the



Peachtree City Water & Sewerage

Long Term Disability

Effective July 1, 2019

Principal [*]	Principal			
Benefits				
Schedule of Benefits				
Elimination Period	90 Days			
Benefit Percentage	60%			
Maximum Monthly Benefit	\$10,000			
Benefit Duration	SSNRA			
Own Occupation Coverage	24 Months			
Pre-Existing ConditionLimitation				
Mental & Nervous/Drug & Alcohol	24 Months			
Financials	Current	Proposed		
Monthly Covered Payroll	\$85,162.00	\$85,162.00		
Rate per \$100	\$0.960	\$1.050		
Estimated Monthly Premium	\$817.56	\$894.20		
Estimated Annual Premium	\$9,810.66	\$10,730.41		
Annual Premium Variance	\$919.75			
Percentage Variance	9.37%			
Participation Requirement	100%			
Rate Guarantee	To 12/1/2019			

Note: The plan descriptions are based on JSL's interpretation of the current plan design. We have attempted to duplicate the existing schedule of benefits, but actual plan provisions and claim administration will vary between insurance carriers. This description does not replace or supersede the contract. Insurance company offers are based on the information submitted and plan design outlined. Rating and conditions may be modified or withdrawn in the event that the risk characteristics at the time of enrollment are materially different from those assumed in the quotation.